Phoenix Peer Exchange Panel October 2017

Equitable Economic Development Fellowship
The **National League of Cities (NLC)** is dedicated to helping city leaders build stronger, equitable, sustainable and inclusive communities.

**PolicyLink** connects the work of people on the ground to the creation of sustainable communities of opportunity that allow everyone to participate and prosper.

The **Urban Land Institute (ULI)** has a mission to provide leadership in the responsible use of land and in creating and sustaining thriving communities worldwide.
The EED Fellowship is made possible with support from:

The **Surdna Foundation** seeks to foster sustainable communities in the United States - communities guided by principles of social justice and distinguished by healthy environments, strong local economies, and thriving cultures.

The **Open Society Foundations** work to build vibrant and tolerant societies whose governments are accountable and open to the participation of all people.
State of the Cities 2017

Top Ten Issues

- Econ. Development: 66%
- Public Safety: 64%
- Infrastructure: 43%
- Budgets: 43%
- Housing: 42%
- Education: 36%
- Energy & Environment: 24%
- Health: 23%
- Demographics: 21%
- Data & Tech.: 16%
Top 10 issues over the last four years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Safety</td>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Public Safety</td>
<td>Public Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budgets</td>
<td>Budgets</td>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Budgets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>Environment/Energy</td>
<td>Housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>Data/Technology</td>
<td>Environment/Energy</td>
<td>Environment/Energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care</td>
<td>Environment/Energy</td>
<td>Demographics</td>
<td>Health Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>Demographics</td>
<td>Data/Technology</td>
<td>Energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immigration</td>
<td>Health Care</td>
<td>Data/Technology</td>
<td>Immigration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Equitable Economy: The Challenge

Share of workers earning at least $15/hour by race/ethnicity: Phoenix City, AZ, 1980-2014

- White: 78%, 74%, 80%, 78%
- People of color: 66%, 55%, 53%, 51%

IPUMS
Equitable Economy: The Challenge

Percent owner-occupied households by race/ethnicity: Phoenix City, AZ, 2014

- All: 53.4%
- White: 62.7%
- Black: 26.7%
- Latino: 42.9%
- Asian or Pacific Islander: 53.1%
- Native American: 24.5%
- Mixed/other: 45.1%
- People of color: 40.4%

IPUMS
Equitable Economy: The Challenge

Unemployment rate by race/ethnicity: Phoenix City, AZ, 1980-2014

IPUMS
Equality vs. Equity
What is Equitable Economic Development?

- Unlocks the full potential of the local economy by dismantling barriers and expanding opportunities for low-income people and communities of color.
- Through accountable public action and investment, it grows quality jobs and increases entrepreneurship, ownership, and wealth.
- The result is a stronger, more competitive city.

Definition developed by: the EED Fellows in 2016
Problem Statement
Equitable TOD: South Central Light Rail Extension
How can the City increase community ownership in the corridor through an inclusive business resource system?
Problem Statement

Equitable TOD: South Central Light Rail Extension

How can the City support the implementation of a workforce development program along the corridor extension?
The Panel

- **Abe Farkas**, Senior Project Director, ECONorthwest, Portland, OR (Chair)
- **Isabel Chanslor**, Chief Program Officer, Neighborhood Development Center (NDC), Saint Paul, MN
- **Eric Friedlander**, Chief Resilience Officer, Office of Resilience and Community Services, City of Louisville, KY
- **Aliza Gallo**, Economic Development Manager, City of Oakland, CA
- **Thalia Leng**, Transportation Planner, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, CA
- **Emeka Moneme**, Deputy Director, Federal City Council, Washington, DC
- **Alex Salazar**, Principal, Salazar Architect, Inc., Portland, OR
- **Arturo Sanchez**, Assistant City Manager, City of Sacramento, CA
- **Lesley Varghese**, Chief of Staff, Mayor’s Office, City of Austin, TX
Presentation Outline

1. General Observations
2. Communication and Capacity Building
3. Community Investment
4. Entrepreneurship Ecosystem & Workforce Development
5. Conclusions & Homework
General Citywide Observations
General Citywide Observations

- City staff are demonstrably committed to addressing inequality and community concerns.
- There is little consensus on what equitable economic development is or how it should be measured.
- Innovative policies around sustainability and design including adaptive reuse.
- Strong collaborative partnerships with diverse stakeholders.
- Need to prepare workforce for anticipated growth in the new economy.
- State legislature has limited local toolbox for economic development and affordable housing.
Opportunities: South Central Light Rail Extension
Opportunities: South Central Light Rail Extension

• Phoenix South Central has a rich cultural identity and community pride.
• The diverse communities and established, multi-generational businesses and residents create a talented and resilient neighborhood that can thrive with new investment.
• Some community improvements can be done quickly and inexpensively before light rail construction starts, and this will help gain community confidence in the corridor project.
• Acknowledging historic disinvestment in the community will help build trust for the South Central Corridor project.
• City-owned and other public land can be leveraged to achieve neighborhood preservation and affordability goals.
• The City’s track record of partnerships and innovation can provide South Central Corridor more robust business and job creation, as well as neighborhood amenities and community facilities.
• Policies and programs can mitigate the downsides of gentrification.
Challenges: South Central Light Rail Extension
Challenges: South Central Light Rail Extension

• The public realm of South Central Corridor exhibits diminished design quality, walkability, landscaping, and maintenance—especially as compared to other neighborhoods of the City—which leads residents there to complain of differential treatment or neglect.

• Historic actions (and inaction) on city-led projects has fostered mistrust in many South Central Corridor residents.

• There is apprehension that the South Central Corridor project will cater largely to the affluent, that development speculation will increase land prices, that new development will displace households and businesses, and that the community’s soul and character will be lost.

• Community stakeholders worry that the City will not be able to deliver on promised project benefits.
Presentation Outline

1. General Observations
2. Communication and Capacity Building
3. Community Investment
4. Entrepreneurship Ecosystem and Workforce Development
5. Conclusions & Homework
Legacy of Lack of Transparency
Facts

• City staff understands and acknowledges that communication with the community is challenged by past experiences (i.e., airport, light rail, historic neglect) and unfulfilled promises.
Legacy of Lack of Transparency

Recommendations:

• Engage in an honest discussion about this history and how it impacts issues of equity.

• Ensure that this communication is ongoing and extends beyond the rail project, to community planning and other needs.

• Integrate housing, small/local business and workforce development staff into the transit project, and jointly set goals, acknowledging that the project will create opportunities in these issue areas.
“Transportation is one sector that needs to become better at defining project success, people who are passionate about doing good work can get caught up in the work itself without realizing that they also need measurable outcomes to make decisions on future projects.”

Ben Hecht, CEO – Living Cities
Engagement
Facts

• The city successfully engaged the public to secure funding for T2050.
Engagement

Recommendations

• Enlist third-party specialists/organizations to provide additional capacity for community engagement.

• Leverage third party specialists and city staff to participate in more neighborhood based personal engagement.

• Amplify the voices and concerns of under-represented communities (i.e., African-Americans, Vietnamese-Americans, Re-entrants, refugees, etc.).

• Develop a narrative, between the City and community, of the most valuable assets and characteristics.

• Deploy interactive “show and tell” tactics to educate residents and market the corridor project (i.e., Pop-up outreach events); combine and appropriately sequence conversation/listening and visuals/education.
Engagement Case Studies: Buffalo, NY

Clean Sweep Initiative

- Uses data analytics to more effectively deploy resources in challenged neighborhoods.
Engagement Case Studies: Twin Cities, MN

Equitable Development Principles & Scorecard – A Tool For Community Planners

• Concrete and measurable community benefits for local residents as defined by their community.
Engagement Case Studies: San Francisco, CA

SFMTA, Tenderloin District, Safer Taylor
- Pop-up workshop helped determine the best long-term safety improvements for Taylor Street and showcase a range of opportunities to create more inviting spaces.
Civic Infrastructure
Civic Infrastructure

Facts
• The city’s team is smart, personally committed and reflects the diversity of South Central Corridor.
Civic Infrastructure

Recommendations

• Fund capacity-building for community organizing and advocacy to build community fluency on the more technical issues related to the project and city planning.

• Decide whether to provide grants to existing community to assist with engagement (thereby creating capacity building opportunities for grassroots organizations) or to jointly create a new venue for engagement.

• Create space for the diverse community voices to engage in honest communication about the concerns and opportunities.

• Treat as long-term structural investment on the city’s behalf; engagement issues and community are not going away after the project.

• Jointly develop with the community a culturally driven identity and brand for the corridor that respects and incorporates the existing community identity.
Community Quarterback Model

- Ensures that the people in the targeted neighborhood are engaged, included, and served. That housing, education, and community wellness components are successful and sustainable, and serves as a single point of accountability for partners and funders.

Health Navigator Model

- Helps patients get the best healthcare possible from his or her doctors, hospitals and other care providers.
Presentation Outline

1. General Observations
2. Communication and Capacity Building
3. Community Investment
4. Entrepreneurship Ecosystem and Workforce Development
5. Conclusions & Homework
Protect, Preserve and Unify the culture, commerce and community of South Central Corridor.
Beyond The Rail

• City has exhibited a commitment to public engagement and deployed an outreach strategy via the Community Advisory Board structure.
  • Engaging with existing community groups (South Central Corridor, Churches, schools related, etc.); and key business partners.

However:

• Outreach has not led to the city internalizing the community’s angst or acknowledging the “City’s” role in perceived past issues/slight. By doing so and committing to transparently work with the community this narrative can be changed.

• Work needs to be done to create/ease social tensions and help the community come together around common opportunities - easy wins (infrastructure and neighborhood issues just off the transit corridor).
Beyond The Rail

Through easy wins the project can begin to move beyond dialogue of fear:

• Community Displacement & Deconstruction - losing their community identity, economic base, and cultural vibrancy because of new investment.

• Marginalization - a repeat of airport expansion project which caused neighborhood to be vacated or changed.
Beyond The Rail

The project must begin to tackle:

• Feelings of neglect.

• Social Tension: Both political and cultural and includes the belief that politics have impacted opportunities – and that opportunities are framed for them not by them.

• The Unknown: City has an opportunity to be transparent and consistent by reframing project to reflect the community - reframe beyond the rail.
Beyond The Rail

Moving beyond the rail and building trust means broadening the public engagement scope to focus not only on transit, but also on neighborhoods and housing.
Corridor Into Neighborhood
The community and stakeholders currently perceive this project as a “light rail extension” impacting their neighborhood when this could be reframed as a “neighborhood improvement project” that provides light rail extension and improved access to downtown Phoenix.
Corridor Into Neighborhood

Recommendations:

• Building on framework and methodology in Reinvent PHX, engage in a context and culturally sensitive planning process that includes the 7th St. to 7th Ave. area rather than focusing exclusively on Central Avenue and technical aspects of the light rail extension.

• Communicate this planning process to the public with a specific timeline.
The vibrant, cultural fabric of South Central Corridor neighborhood is a unique asset and can have a symbiotic, supportive relationship with the Central Ave. TOD corridor.

**Recommendation:**

- Develop and communicate the existing community assets, future investments, and benefits for both the corridor and greater neighborhood, from larger potential improvements such as parks to smaller scale public realm improvements.
Fruitvale Village- Oakland, California

Fruitvale Village is a mixed use and mixed income TOD project located directly to the north of the Fruitvale Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) station in Oakland, California.

The development is situated on the site of a former BART parking lot roughly 4.5 miles south of downtown Oakland.

Work on the first phase began in 1999 and was completed in 2004.
Circulation and Access
Circulation and Access

The side streets and major intersections provide capacity and access to and from the corridor and stations and can be a valuable amenity for both the existing community and future residents.

**Recommendation:**

- Develop a circulation plan with the community that clarifies future neighborhood vehicle, bicycle, and pedestrian movement, building on existing physical assets.
The Ravenswood Business District /4 Corners TOD Plan

- Community-based vision in East Palo Alto based around a walkable employment center with a network of parks, trails, and community facilities.
Near Term Investment

Opportunity in the near term to use easy wins or “low hanging fruit” to help build trust with the community, expand the corridor project into the neighborhood, and implement first steps of the overall vision.

Recommendation:

• Implement easily constructible projects within the next two years, (ie. alleyway improvements, street safety, lighting, etc.) through a process where the community can recommend and prioritize improvements.
The Polk Streetscape Project in San Francisco implement quick and easy improvements such as crosswalks, pedestrian lead times, and bus efficiency improvements within the first 6 months of the project timeline that will be followed by capital investments within the next 2-3 years.
Housing touches everyone, home owners, renters, mobile home communities, and others. From what we have heard there is not yet a cohesive housing plan as it relates to transit improvements, and the likely increase in property values, and related impacts and opportunities. A housing planning process is a hook for community participation, it can address related community development needs, and help the city build bridges and relationships.
Community Housing Plan: Owners & Renters

Recommendations:

• Involve Housing staff in the transit planning process.
• Conduct a comprehensive assessment of city-owned lands in the neighborhood, and other opportunity sites owned by community partners like Churches, benevolent land owners, non-profits and so on.
• Hold city owned lands for use by the existing community, as a form of equity they have built up over the years.
• Work with partners to develop a community-driven participatory planning process, and feasible plan, that includes workforce housing at many scales (small and large), new community amenities, and linkages to existing community assets.
• Develop an understanding of upcoming developments in the private sector along the corridor, and the impacts they may have on future housing and community needs.
Workforce Housing & Mixed Use Sites
There are city owned lands in the direct path of the transit line that have not yet been taken up as TOD sites.

**Recommendations:**

- Leverage these existing opportunity sites to create larger TOD projects for affordable workforce housing that enhances commercial uses along the corridor.
- Work with non-profit and for-profit developers of mixed-use housing to create public-private partnership models of development.
- Buy additional land suitable for larger developments soon before rapid inflation occurs.
Get ahead of speculation in home owner market that is and will continue to occur

**Recommendations:**

- Develop an education component so that folks understand the hidden equity in their land and to encourage the community to stay in place.
- Adopt policies that support long-time residents and low-income families (such as developed in Philadelphia), examples: caps on property taxes for long-time residents; freezing property tax on seniors; hardship payment plans that spread out payments and limit penalties for delinquent payments; hardship deferrals; taxable value reductions; and tax rebates.
- Learn from innovative mobile home non-profit developers, who purchase and replace homes, and preserve the long term affordability of mobile home communities (ie. St. Vincent De Paul and NeighborWorks).
Presentation Outline

1. General Observations
2. Communication and Capacity Building
3. Community Investment
4. Entrepreneurship Ecosystem and Workforce Development
5. Conclusions & Homework
Build On The Now
Build On The Now

- Direct outreach and communication to the local businesses about the construction project.
- Technical assistance to individual businesses to prepare for LRT construction.
- The creation of a workforce development partners asset map.
- TOD grant funds to implement a business assistance program.
- Contracts for design, art and construction which require local participation and workforce development opportunities.
Entrepreneurship Eco-system Framework
Entrepreneurship Eco-system Framework

• Provide opportunities for locally owned neighborhood businesses to access services, capital and assets that will assist them in preparing for, surviving, and thriving after LRT construction.

• In order to organize the vast options within this realm, we are recommending that the strategies be organized under four pillars that are critical to providing opportunities to create wealth and ownership:
  • Entrepreneurship training
  • Micro and small business lending
  • Business Services/Technical Assistance
  • Real estate activities
Entrepreneurship & Small Business Development Tools
Entrepreneurship & Small Business Development Tools

Entrepreneurship Training:
- For startups and Second stage businesses
- Contractor businesses and Food based businesses
- Retail business and Service based businesses
- Cooperatives (Food Coops)

Micro and small business lending (high risk lending):
- Forgivable loans (debt free)
- Facade grants/matching grant/loan
- Low interest loans
- Relocation assistance fund
- Contractor lending
- Islamic-ally acceptable financing
Business Services/Technical Assistance Opportunities:

- Partner with groups like SEED SPOT to locate opportunities and programs in the South Central neighborhood.
- Partner with groups to create a local team of business advisors and consultants on-hand to address specific coaching and services needs.
- Provide workshops and best practices on employee owned cooperatives and food halls.
• Building and property ownership loans for small business owners.
• Tenant improvement funds/loan for small business owners.
• First right of refusal offered to local residents and/or non-profit developers to develop sites owned by the city.
• Retain and expand the New Market Tax Credit loan pool.
Other Strategies

• Waivers, utility deferments, to reduce operating costs.
• Merchant association - for mentorship opportunities.
• Rent reduction program available to small businesses during the highest levels of construction.
• Implement value capture strategies like property tax abatements or subsidies.
• Explore adopting hydroponic food production and education programs for youth developed by Whispering Roots in Omaha.
Recommendations

• Provide small businesses located 1/4 to 1/2 mile from the construction route with access to the construction mitigation services/tools.

• Provide access to both construction and business mitigation services to small local owned businesses and franchise owners.

• Establish an online portal listing all the lending tools available to local entrepreneurs and small business owners.
Workforce Development Opportunities

**Workforce**

**Hours of operation**

- Tues., Wed., Thurs. - Noon - 4 p.m.
- Fri. - *Please see Staff*
- Sat. - 9 a.m. - Noon
- Closed: Sun. & Mon.

**Phoenix Works**

- Search for a job
- Create a resume
- Improve job skills
- Explore career options
The Workforce Development Strategy should be comprehensive: direct jobs for current and future LRT extensions; LRT operations; and employment opportunities resulting from new investments, new business opportunities and current business expansion.
Workforce Development Opportunities

**Workforce**

Hours of Operation

- Tues., Wed., Thurs. - Noon - 4p
- Fri. - Please see Staff
- Sat. - 9a - Noon
- Closed: Sun. & Mon.

PhoenixWorks
- search for a job
- create a resume
- improve job skills
- explore career options
A broader view of the workforce development strategy will allow for greater resident inclusion and opportunities to build a strong workforce. Critical to achieving this goal are:

Expand and strengthen strong partnerships with workforce training providers, as well as, educational institutions, construction trade associations, current employers, and LRT contractors to create and promote career ladder and living wage opportunities.

• Develop a strong creative outreach campaign that includes community leaders, partner organizations and schools to recruit and mentor participants, especially youth.
• Establish a scholarship program for existing businesses to support expansion, possibly resulting in new jobs as well as a business retention program to preserve current jobs.
• Incorporate recommendations outlined in the Quality of Life Plan to create workforce development strategies focusing on local service industry needs (maintenance, lawn services, upholstery, repairs, etc.).
• Use creativity and innovation to train and employ the diverse populations including immigrants, refugees and undocumented populations in culturally respectful ways.
Workforce Development Recommendations

• Use the Workforce Development Asset Map to identify qualified trainers and training gaps.
• Establish initiatives like an Anchor Institution Initiative to maximize and local purchasing and contracting of locally owned businesses. Such strategies worked successfully with educational and health care institutions.
• Support Mentorships and internship opportunities for youth.
• Ensure that the local project visioning center includes information about workforce development, training and job opportunities.
Workforce Development Opportunities

Step 1: Set Strategic Direction

Step 2: Supply, Demand, Discrepancies

Step 3: Develop Action Plan

Step 4: Implement Action Plan

Step 5: Monitor, Evaluate, Revise

Workforce Planning Model
Workforce Development Opportunities

• Denver WIN and WIN-LA are examples of collaborative partnerships of CBO, cities, community colleges to help job seekers, companies and local communities through demand driven workforce, services and the creation of pathway opportunities in the transportation and construction industries.
• Their models offer a range of services from assessment, employment training, placement, and most importantly, on-going outreach.
• Funding Examples
  • Given that government funding sources are limited it is vital to maximize partnerships and collaborations.
  • The San Francisco Foundation – Bay Area Workforce Funding Collaborative is a partnership of foundations which coordinate funding initiative for low income job seekers.
  • WorkSystem, Inc. in Portland is a collaboration of workforce providers which has resulted in leveraging of training funds, avoiding duplication and coordination of services to clients.
Presentation Outline
1. General Observations
2. Communication and Capacity Building
3. Community Investment
4. Entrepreneurship Ecosystem and Workforce Development
5. Conclusions & Homework
Conclusions

• The City and community need to agree on definition and metrics of equitable economic development.

• Bringing the City’s experience with partnerships, ability to inform decisions with data, and civic entrepreneurship to the South Central Corridor is essential to identifying resources (human and financial capital) to delivering on expectations for area residents and businesses.

• There is an opportunity to capitalize on the new light rail extension to invest not just in the corridor but also in the surrounding neighborhoods through circulation and public realm improvements, building on the vibrancy and culture of the South Central Corridor.

• There is an opportunity to create a community driven planning process, with both home owners and renters focused on City owned land and related sites, to create affordable workforce, housing, and community serving commercial space. This will help preserve and expand cultural and economic equity in the neighborhoods that may otherwise be lost over time.

• Honest communication must be in both directions – between the government and community – about the LTR project and other issues impacted by the LTR project.

• A comprehensive and integrated set of business support tools which are creatively leveraged to support the technical assistance and lending activities will provide the city, neighborhoods, and partners the ability to be nimble and responsive to small business needs before and during construction.

• Workforce development is a critical component of TOD that can provide immediate and long-term community wealth building opportunities.
Homework – Next Steps

• Convene at least one meeting with groups trusted by the community (i.e., Black Wall Street, La Raza Community Development, Promise Arizona, MBK, etc.) to jointly assess the community’s strengths, capacity and needs for the purpose of outreach to potential philanthropic partners to support an ongoing structure for engagement.

• Meet with South Central Corridor stakeholders to craft a community-identified strength-based narrative for the purpose of supporting branding and communication efforts in the community.

• Connect with Purpose Built Communities (in Atlanta) to receive a briefing on the Community Quarterback model to assess its viability as engagement strategy.

• Map the:
  • Commercial real estate landscape highlighting developable lots owned by local residents, institutions, businesses and the City.
  • Lending tools currently available and begin to expand potential partners.
  • Locations where desired retail and service business can be located within the neighborhoods based on leakage assessments.

• Identify potential partners to pool loan resources to the corridor, adapt lending tools and create a lending portal.

Next Check-in:
Fellowship Mid-Term Retreat: Los Angeles | January 24-26, 2018
Equitable Economic Development Fellowship

Thank You
Thank you to the following people for assisting our panel: